Asian/Pacific Librarians Career Choices: A Mixed Method Study

Jianzhong Zhou
Head of Reference Department,
California State University, Sacramento, U.S.A.
Email: zhou@csus.edu

Glen Zhou
Student,
University of California, Berkeley, U.S.A
Email: glenzhou@berkeley.edu

Allan Zhou
Student,
University of California, Berkeley, U.S.A
Email: allan.zhou@berkeley.edu

Milan Zhou
Student,
Folsom High School, U.S.A
Email: miltonzhou98@gmail.com

Keywords: Asian American Librarians; Pacific Islander Librarians; Chief Librarians; Leadership Achievement Gap; Statistical analysis; Quantitative method; Qualitative method; Mixed methods research

【Abstract】
This is a mixed method study of Asian/Pacific librarians career choices related to leadership positions. The statistical analyses are based on data from 91 librarians in survey Q1 distributed to 600+ CALA and APALA members. The correlation, prediction of association, cross-tabbing, and ANOVA tests were applied to the survey. The result shows that the leadership position is correlated with number of years worked in the library profession, number of publications, number of voluntary job changes, and national professional association’s involvement. There was a suggested correlation between leadership positions and additional advanced degrees and over half of librarians with a doctoral degree are in chief librarian positions. The study also nullifies the hypothesis that achieving leadership position
is less likely for first generation immigrants or immigrants who did not receive k-12 or undergraduate education in the North America. In addition, the differences in professional, community, and political involvement are examined among professional librarians, supervising librarians and chief librarians. The comments from the quantitative survey Q1 contain rich data which can’t be interpreted by existing statistical methods. The Q1 comments became the first section of a follow-up qualitative study using situation coding and subject perspective coding method. A separate qualitative survey Q2 was sent to 12 Asian/Pacific chief librarians only. Eight chief librarians completed Q2 covering biographical information and in-depth questions on perceptions of leadership achievement gap among Asian/Pacific American librarians. Comparison of comments of Q1 for professional librarians and Q2 for chief librarians suggested many similar themes emerged. The triangulation from different Asian/Pacific librarian population validated the finding.

Introduction

The overall problem statement of the authors’ year-long study on Asian American and Pacific Islander (AAPI) librarians is why there is such a low representation of highly educated AAPI among top leadership positions in education in general, and in librarianship in particular. Part one of the study, a descriptive study published by Zhou and others in April 2013 provided demographics, descriptive statistics collected from a statistical survey Q1 and government published statistics in answering the following research questions: What are the demographics of AAPI librarians in 2010s? What are the major factors that influenced AAPI librarians’ career choices? What is the future growth of AAPI librarians compared to other racial/ethnical groups? Part two is a mixed method research and it is trying to answer the next set of questions: What factors associated with successful pathways toward leadership positions for AAPI librarians in North America? What are the major cultural, social, political and structural obstacles that prevent AAPI librarians from reaching top leadership positions?

Q1 Survey

The Section I of the quantitative survey Q1 has nine questions related to demographic data of AAPI librarians: (1) generations of as immigrants in the United States, (2) first degree/diploma received in North America, (3) geographic region of current work place, (4) graduate degrees received in addition to Masters Degree of Library Science (MLS), (5) number of years worked as professional librarian, (6) number of publications, (7) service in national professional associations, government and school board memberships, (8) civil involvement in local and national level, and (9) the highest professional library positions ever held. Question I-9 is the dependent variable and multi-variable correlation and regression analysis were recommended based on independent variables in questions I-1 to I-8. Question I-10 to I-12 asks AAPI librarians involvement outside their daily jobs, such as service in library profession and in communities. Section II of the Q1 survey focuses on AAPI librarians’ perceptions of influencing factors on the pathway to leadership positions.

Correlation and Regression Tests on I-1 to I-9

The most common quantitative method is the correlation and regression analysis. The authors first ran the correlation test on SPSS version 19 for questions I-1 to I-9. The result shows that the highest positions AAPI librarians achieved are strongly correlated with education attainment, years worked in the profession, number of publications, number of voluntary job changes, and professional organization involvement with p<0.01. The effect size for number of years worked is large.
The effect sizes for number of voluntary job changes and number of publications are close to large, while the effect sizes with highest education attainment and with professional involvement are medium (0.25<r<0.50). The generation as immigrants, the first degree received in North America, and the residential city population variables all have p value greater than 0.05 - the authors rejected the null hypothesis that AAPI librarians leadership status is related to their generations as immigrants, whether they received k-12 education in North America, and whether they live in a big city or a small town.

With the strong correlation and medium to large effect sizes, a regression analysis is usually recommended to calculate predictions. However, due to the small sample size and nine variables in questions I-1 to I-9, the N is not large enough to meet the criteria for a regression analysis. The authors chose to use more sophisticated statistical methods with explanations for prediction of associations instead of traditional correlation and regression analysis.

The multiple variables regression test for prediction requires:
- N> 50+ 8*m, where m is the number of variables.
  For Q1 questions I-1 to I-9, m equals 9 and N needs to be greater than 122. The highest N among all Q1 questions is 91. (Tabachnick & Fidell, 2001)

**Prediction of Association Tests using Cross-tabbing for Variables in I-1 to I-9**

Instead of a regression test for prediction, a cross-tab Chi-square test is used to analyze relationships among variables that are nominal, categorical, ordinal, or scale. In addition to Chi-square test, Gamma is used as a measurement to predict the value of a dependent variable based on the values of independent variables. In statistics, Gamma measures Proportional Reduction in Error (PRE), and PRE is a major criterion to measure associations between dependent variables and independent variables. Gamma varies from a value of 0.0 for the weakest level of association, to a value of +1.0 for the strongest level of association for a direct or positive, or -1.0 for the strongest level of association for a negative or inverse relationship.

The result of Chi-square tests and Gamma tests on SPSS version 19 for questions I-1 to I-9 will be discussed below. Only results with both Chi-square p-value and Gamma p-value not exceeding 0.05 are considered statistically significant.

There were some significant findings based on four categories of AAPI librarians in response to question I-9, 1) non-supervisory coded as 1, 2) supervisory coded as 2, 3) chief librarian overseeing less than 10 staff coded as 3, and 4) chief librarians overseeing 10+ staff coded as 4. For some questions, only Chi-square or Gamma is significant, but not both. These will be discussed below:

- I-1. Choose your generation as an AAPI immigrant. If you are a foreign-born citizen or legal resident of the U.S., you are a first generation immigrant.

  The Pearson Chi-square is significant with p=0.048<0.05. The Gamma is -0.173, which shows a weak inverse relationship. It means second generation immigrants are LESS LIKELY than the first generation immigrants to move up from librarians (category 1) to chief librarians overseeing 50+ staff (category 4). However, in the Gamma test, p=0.350>0.05. The test is not significant when p> .05; therefore the cross-tabbing of I-1 with I-9 is NOT statistically significant because the result fails to satisfy both Pearson and Gamma significant test.

- I-2. Please choose the first diploma or degree you have received in the United States or Canada - not significant

- I-3. What is the total population of the city/county/metropolitan area where you work - not significant

- I-4. Please select your highest education attainment - not significant due to small number of chief librarians
There were no significant findings during cross-tabbing of I-2, I-3, and I-4 with I-9 under Chi-square and Gamma tests. However, I-4 is very close to significant as Pearson $p=0.061$ and Gamma $p=0.067$ are both just over 0.05 which suggested a correlation exists between highest education attainment and library positions. It is worth noting that one third of AAPI chief librarians (in category 4) have doctoral degrees (3.0) and one third chief librarians have additional master’s degrees (2.0). Looking from a different angle of highest education attainment, 50% of AAPI librarians with doctoral degrees are chief librarians overseeing 50+ staff.

- I-5. Number of years you worked as a professional librarian, IT professional or other information professional - significant and strong direct correlation.

Both Pearson Chi-square and Gamma $p$-value are at 0.000 and the Gamma value at 0.654 shows strong direct correlation. The choices in I-5 are categorized into three groups, working less than 10 years is 1, 10-14 is 2, and 15 and over is 3, as shown in the Table 4.6. The more years AAPI librarians work, the more likely they will be chief librarians.

- I-6. Number of SCHOLARLY publications, including but not limited to journal articles, books, book chapters, book reviews, annotated bibliographies, of which you are an author or a co-author - significant and fairly strong direct correlation.

All AAPI chief librarians have 6 or more publications and half of all librarians who publish 16 or more are in chief librarian’s category.

- I-7. How many times have you made VOLUNTARY professional job changes? Please note, a move-up in rank, i.e. from Assistant Librarian to Associate Librarian in the same position is NOT a job change. But a position change within the same institution should be considered a job change - significant and fairly strong direct correlation.

Almost no professional librarians are appointed as a chief librarian at the beginning of their career path and they have to move up by voluntary job changes. The more times AAPI librarians make voluntary job changes, the more likely they will become chief librarians. Half of librarians who made career changes five or six times are chief librarians and two of three librarians who changed jobs more than six times are chief librarians.

- I-8. What is the highest position you have held in national library/information science organizations, such IFLA, ALA, or its divisions, PLA, ACRL, LITA etc. Please do NOT include CALA, APALA or regional community organizations here - significant and fairly direct correlation.

Except one, all chief librarians held leadership positions in national library and professional organizations, but only a very small percentage of professional librarians ever did so.

Cross-tabbing and ANOVA Tests on Variables in I-10 to I-12

- I-10. What is your level of involvement within your library and the parent institution, i.e. an academic library’s parent organization will be the university. Choose ALL that apply!
  
  o Served on library committees - not significant
  o Served as library committee chair - significant and strong correlation.
    - $N=83$, Pearson Chi-square $p=0.002$
    - Gamma = 0.567, $p=0.000$
  o Served on parent institution’s committees - significant and strong correlation.
    - $N=83$, Pearson Chi-square $p=0.002$
    - Gamma = 0.567, $p=0.000$
  o Served as parent institution’s committee chair - significant and very strong correlation.
    - $N=83$, Pearson Chi-square $p=0.017$
Serving on a parent institution committee or being a chair, or serving as a library committee chair is strongly correlated to leadership positions. In contrast, serving as a library committee member or participating in Asian/Pacific employee associations are not significantly related to leadership positions.

- I-11. What is your level of involvement with the local government and school district? Choose ALL that apply!
  - Regularly participate in general elections - significant and close to strong correlation
    - N=83, Pearson Chi-square p=0.045
    - Gamma = 0.449, p=0.009
  - Regularly participate in primary election and other local elections - not significant
  - Attended, at least once, school district/college board meetings - not significant
  - Attended, at least once, city/county/local government council/board meetings - significant and strong correlation
    - N=83, Pearson Chi-square p=0.042
    - Gamma = 0.584, p=0.007
  - Appointed or elected to serve on local government or school district council/board - n/a
  - Non-citizen and not eligible to vote - n/a

Regular participation in general elections and attending local government council/board meetings at least once are significant and strongly correlated to AAPI appointment to leadership positions.

- I-12. What is your involvement with the regional or local communities? Choose ALL that apply!
  - Board/Council member of local Asian community organizations, i.e. Chinese school - not significant
  - Board/Council member of a community organization, i.e. Homeowners association, local church - significant and very strong correlation.
    - N=83, Pearson Chi-square p=0.004
    - Gamma = 0.715, p=0.014
  - Board/Council member of Asian professional organizations, i.e. CLA, CALA, APALA - not significant
  - Board/Council member of professional organizations, i.e. Toastmasters International, Friends of the library - significant and strong correlation
    - N=83, Pearson Chi-square p=0.000
    - Gamma = 0.788, p=0.014
  - Board/Council member of a hobby club, sports, music, cooking - n/a

Active involvement in the community and national professional organizations is strongly correlated to AAPI library leadership positions. On the other hand, active involvement in just Asian community and Asian professional organization is not significant.

In addition to cross-tabbing analysis, One-way Analysis of Variance (ANOVA) is recommended for questions I-10 to I-12 to seek difference in means among different groups of AAPI librarians—non-supervisor, supervisor and chief librarians. ANOVA tests the differences of more than two means of dependent variables in different categories. The Test of Homogeneity of Variances (THV) is used to check variances in different categories NOT significantly different from each other. This is the assumption for a valid ANOVA test. The THV test has to be NOT statistically significant in order for ANOVA test to be valid, assuming p-value of ANOVA does not exceed 0.05. The THV, the ANOVA test, and the Welch test showed a significant difference.
among three groups of AAPI librarians in their institutional, government, and community involvement. For example, the means of government involvement for non-supervisor librarians (0.91), supervisor librarians (1.58), and chief librarians (2.11) are significantly different from one another. In library or institutional involvement and community involvement, the means of chief librarian group are also significantly higher than that of the other two groups, but the means of non-supervisor and supervisor groups do not have statistically significant differences.

**ANOVA Test on Variables in Questions II-1 to II-3**

Section II questions test perceptions among different groups of AAPI librarians on factors associated with top library leadership positions. The authors first ran Chi-square combined with Gamma tests on questions II-1, II-2, II-3; each question has 6 to 10 variables. Because the n is so small in each of the 6-8 variables with the total N of 91, there are very few significant findings under the Chi-square test and even fewer after being filtered by Gamma tests. Therefore, the ANOVA test was used on II-1 to II-3 as well. Due to the small sample size in each variable within Section II questions, the THV test cannot be used. Therefore, the validity of the ANOVA significances needs to be interpreted with caution.

It is interesting to note that the only significant difference between AAPI chief librarians and other groups is on the question of the “Asian culture of working hard.” Chief librarians took a neutral stand with means of 3.00 out of 5.00, while non-chief librarian groups have a mean of 2.17; Non chief librarians do not believe that the “Asian culture of working hard” helps AAPI to reach library leadership positions. For supervisor librarians, there are two means that are significantly different from the other groups. Supervisor librarians have a higher belief (3.71 vs. 3.12) that “Asian/ Pacific librarians are perceived by hiring authorities as knowledgeable and technically proficient, but not as good leaders,” and supervisor librarians are “less likely (2.15 vs. 3.00) to relocate to bigger cities for library leadership positions.”

The supervisor librarians are the largest group among AAPI librarians and they are the pool for future chief librarians, their beliefs and perceptions are important in the battle to narrow the AAPI librarian leadership gap.

**Q1 Comments and Q2**

At the end of the Q1 survey, an open comments section provided additional qualitative data that are beyond the scope of current statistical analyses. One open ended question asked respondents to recommend AAPI chief librarians or mentors. From the responses, the authors collected a dozen names of current and retired AAPI chief librarians and a subsequent qualitative survey Q2 was conducted.

The qualitative study Q2 is trying to provide a different perspective from AAPI chief librarians to address the two research questions mentioned above. In addition, in-depth questions in Q2 seek causes of AAPI librarian leadership achievement gap and help AAPI community and decision makers draw policy recommendations to address the under-representation of AAPI in top leadership positions.

A chief librarian is defined as the highest ranked librarian in an organization who supervises at least 10 full time equivalent librarians and staffs. By definition, a chief librarian should not be reporting to another librarian in an organization and this study excluded school libraries and very small libraries. Most school libraries are one person libraries with part-time staff or student assistants. The research subjects of Q2 survey were current or retired AAPI chief librarians in medium to large libraries—library directors, deans, or university librarians. There were six individuals who met the desired criteria and were known to the authors before this study. Subsequently, the authors received more AAPI chief librarian names and contact information from participants in the Q1 quantitative survey. The first section of the Q2 survey collects different demographic
data about AAPI chief librarians: their parents’ education attainment, city/urban/rural environment where they spent most of their K-12 years, their college majors and more detailed information about their degrees, leadership development programs they have attended, and job titles from the most recent three positions they have held. The second section of Q2 contains open-ended questions on different perspectives of the leadership achievement gap of AAPI librarians. An invitation/consent letter was sent to AAPI chief librarians by email before they were provided the Q2 survey.

The mixed method research is considered “minimal risk” based on the level of risk guideline provided by the Institutional Review Board. The survey tool allowed for respondents to submit their survey anonymously. All participants were assigned an ID number and access to survey data was limited to the first author and his research assistants who held a password. The original data will only be kept for three years and even the author can’t access the original data after year 2014.

Mixed Methods Research

The combination of a quantitative (statistical) study with a qualitative analysis is called mixed method research, and most statistical studies provide useful qualitative data in the open comment section of the survey. Creswell and Plano Clark (2011) describe the nature of mixed methods research as the “third methodological movement” following the development of first quantitative and then qualitative research. The following are some advantages of using mixed methods, as opposed to a solely qualitative or quantitative design:

• provides strengths that offset the weakness of both quantitative and qualitative research

• provides more evidence for studying a research problem than either quantitative or qualitative research alone

• helps answer questions that cannot be answered by quantitative or qualitative approaches alone

• encourages the use of multiple worldviews, or paradigms and builds bridges across the adversarial divide

• is practical and open to use all methods possible to address a research problem (pp. 12-13)

There are some challenges in using mixed methods as well, typically, “the researcher needs the requisite skills and it may take more time and resources and other researchers may not be convinced of or understand the value of mixed methods” (Creswell and Plano Clark, 2011, pp. 13-15.) Even though mixed methods research is relatively new in the social sciences and education, it has been used in decision making at the highest level in the United States. Congress routinely calls for individual testimonies and listens to personal stories, in addition to all the statistics available to law makers. Greene, Caracelli, and Graham (1989) offered simple typologies of reasons for mixed methods:

• Triangulation seeks convergence, corroboration, and correspondence of results from the different methods

• Complementarity seeks elaboration, enhancement, illustration, and clarification of the results from one method with the results from the other method

• Development seeks to use the results from one method to help develop or inform the other method, where development is broadly construed to include sampling and implementation, as well as measurement decisions

• Initiation seeks the discovery of paradox and contradiction, new perspectives of frameworks, the recasting of questions or results from one method with questions or results from the other method

• Expansion seeks to extend the breadth and range of inquiry by using different methods for different inquiry components (p. 259)

Because this research is the combination of exploring the chance of AAPI librarians to be represented at the
chief librarian level, computing the correlating factors that positively or negatively affect AAPI librarian’s leadership achievement gap, and seeking possible causes for the lack of leadership achievement among AAPI librarians, the mixed methods design provided the best approach for capturing the complexity of this research endeavor. The comment section in Q1 quantitative study provided additional qualitative data, which can’t be interpreted by current statistical methods deployed. The Q2 is based on comments in Q1 in order to get more in-depth information from AAPI chief librarians in medium to large libraries.

One open ended question from Q1 asked the respondent to recommend AAPI chief librarians as potential mentors. Unlike Black American librarians, who have access to a list of African American Library Directors maintained by the Black Caucus of the American Library Association (BCALA), AAPI librarians do not have a central list of chief librarians readily available. Most AAPI librarians do not know any chief AAPI librarians as a role model or as potential mentors for future leaders. About a dozen names surfaced through the Q1 survey and it is very interesting to note that none were the three current ARL AAPI chief librarians. The AAPI chief librarians recommended by Q1 participants are listed below:

- Dr. Hwa Wei Li, Dean of Libraries Emeritus, Ohio University and retired Chief of Asian Division, Library of Congress
- Mr. Haipeng Li, University Librarian of Hong Kong Baptist University, Hong Kong and previous Associate Director, John Cotton Dana Library, Rutgers University, Newark, New Jersey. Mr. Li was previous CALA president and served as CALA executive director in 2011-2012
- Patty Wong, Yolo County Chief Librarian, California
- Nancy Fong, San Leandro City Chief Librarian, California
- Dr. Adriene Lim, Oakland University Chief Librarian, Michigan
- Lana Thelen, Relay School of Education Head Librarian, New York City
- Dr. Ken Yamashita, retired Stockton-San Joaquin County Public Library chief librarian, California
- Dr. Tze-chung Li, Dean Emeritus of Graduate School of Library and Information Science, Dominican University, Illinois

Themes from Q1 Comments

The grounded theory (Glaser & Strauss, 1967) was used in the Q1 comment data analysis. Bogdan and Biklen (2007) describe qualitative data collection and coding development. The author followed some coding systems used in Bogdan and Biklen, particularly the use of situation code and perspectives held by subject code. The “situation” code categorizes participants’ view of themselves in relation to library leadership experiences; it is the overall perception of AAPI librarians in relation to library leadership. The major situation themes emerged from the Q1 comments are discussed below with exemplars.

Lack of Unity among AAPI Librarians

Among five associations of ethnic librarians affiliated with ALA, each of three minority groups is represented by one association for each group -- American Indian Library Association (AILA), Black Caucus of the American Library Association (BCALA), and the National Association to Promote Library and Information Services to Latinos and the Spanish Speaking (REFORMA). The Q1 survey was sent to two associations representing AAPI librarians, Chinese American Librarians Association (CALA), the largest AAPI librarians association with mainly Chinese descendent librarians, and Asian Pacific American Librarians Association (APALA). Unlike other ethnic librarians associations, there is no ONE association representing ALL AAPI librarians. As
several Q1 participants stated the need “to have ONE strong librarians’ organization to represent ALL AAPI librarians,” or “I think our professional organizations need to be stronger.” Another Pacific Islander stated:

Remember to include Pacific Islanders. They are often lost in the AAPI category . . . My family on my Pacific Islander side are technically not immigrants since they were born in the Territory of Hawaii, but they might as well have been since they were not afforded the same rights as full US citizens.

Another participant commented “AAPI - is so broad; there is a lot of diversity within this group. For example, American-born vs. foreign-born are subpopulations of the Chinese contingent . . .” Yet another respondent stated, “AAPI librarians will be much stronger if all Asian/Pacific and other Asian groups band together. These other groups include APALA, Indian, Korean associations . . .” There is a unity theme to have one association to represent all AAPI librarians. It is true that Asian Americans and Pacific Islanders came from different countries and regions and have different culture and history. But African Americans, Hispanics, and American Indians all have different culture and history. There is ONE librarian association to represent each minority group, except AAPI who have two ethnic library associations.

Asian Accent and English Language Proficiency

About two of every three AAPI librarians who participated in the Q1 survey are foreign-born, first generation immigrants. The first diplomas or degrees they received in the United States or Canada were graduate or professional degrees. Almost all AAPI immigrants who came after 18 years old speak English with some level of detectable Asian accent, similar to other first generation immigrants who came to the United States in their 20s or 30s. Asian accents are often linked to poor language and presentation skills (Tien, 1998, p32-49). One participant suggested AAPI librarians need to participate in “more speeches and more meaningful writings.” Another stated that all AAPI librarians are perceived as “not native born person and language is not as fluent as the native person . . . we are pigeon-holed, conscious or unconscious by individual or people who hire.” Yet another one stated:

A major challenge for AAPI librarians is communication ability. First generation immigrants are especially challenged in this area. If the language and communication issues are fully addressed, more AAPI will be able to compete more effectively for leadership positions.

English language proficiency is another situation code the author developed based on the grounded theory. Several participants put language skills and Asian culture together as a major obstacle for AAPI librarians to be in leadership positions. Because two-thirds of AAPI librarians completed their PK-20 education overseas, culture is another theme that emerged from the Q1 comments.

Based on Bogdan and Biklen (2007), the “subject perspective” code summarizes participants’ understanding of each other and towards outsiders. The major themes under subject perspectives are Asian culture, mentors and networking, soft skills for strong leaders, and work-life balance.

Asian Culture

Asian culture emphasizes individual achievement and being a quiet and productive worker in any field assigned. Asian culture does not encourage successful people to tell their stories. As one participant wrote “Asians were told at very young age to not show off your own good points.” Asian culture also prefers loyalty and longevity. Many leaders in Asian countries are similar to “elders” in other cultures. Young people are discouraged to speak up, especially when it is a different opinion from the majority standpoint or from the elders’ opinions. Two participants stated, “Asians
are too docile and quiet to be leaders,” and “We tend not to speak up--at least it’s hard for me to do so.” There are statements that provide a contrast to the perceived leadership skills of the American culture, in which it is an important skill for leaders to tell one’s own successful stories. Not only politicians, from ALA Presidents to the Presidents of the United States, even scholars, such as Eugene Bardach from University of California Berkeley (2009) listed “tell your story” as the eighth and the last step of any successful task for potential leaders. Some AAPI librarians realized the difference in Asian and American cultures and wrote “It’s tough but unless you tout your accomplishments, you are overlooked,” but “we are encouraged not to rock the boat.” Asians are even perceived as having “no desire to be leaders.” More culture related quotes are cited here:

I write this as an AAPI librarian. Culturally informed frameworks, I know, have shaped the way I act and am perceived by others. I do wonder how much of this cultural framework hinders me and how much is from the framework of others being projected onto me.

I think it needs cultural change and significant increase in diversity in the library field. Right now, it is just not possible. AAPI librarians tend to be limited to the fields within their subject expertise . . . . It is difficult to get leadership roles outside the subject field.

Asian Pacific Islander Librarians add a cultural dimension that may not be understood by the mainstream culture. Having them in top leadership positions will help us to be better equipped to serve the growing API communities as well as all people. . . . not being considered for leadership positions by institutions for whom we currently work -- perceptions of AAPI’s lack of leadership and management skills, not applying for positions.

Mentoring and Networking

Mentoring and networking are important social capitals for leaders. Yet, many AAPI librarians stated “I don’t know any Asian/Pacific chief librarians - no model.” No participants cited any one of the three current ARL AAPI chief librarians which indicates a lack of networking among AAPI librarians. The author contacted both CALA and APALA and ascertained no complied information of current or past AAPI chief librarians. Seven participants of the Q1 survey were AAPI chief librarians who supervised 50 or more employees as their highest professional positions, but only one retired AAPI chief librarian wrote that s/he served as a mentor to other AAPI librarians. This may indicate isolationism and lack of group promotion within the AAPI librarian groups. In contrast, the online Directory of Black Library Directors is available from the ALA Web site and readily available to anyone. One participant suggested, “learn from other minority groups e.g. African Americans to see how they fight discrimination . . .” The identification with the struggles and upward mobility of other ethnic groups points to a desire to learn from communities who have experienced oppression and discrimination. Another participant said “having more librarians of color in top leadership positions who are willing to support AAPI librarians.”

Mentoring and networking are mentioned by many participants in Q1 comments. One stated that it is important to have “mentorship for mid-career or mid-management AAPI librarians.” The Q1 survey shows more than 42% of AAPI librarians are supervisors or mid-level managers. Another 6 % are small library chief librarians supervising less than 10 employees. They are the potential pools for AAPI chief librarians supervising 10 or more employees. Mentoring and networking is a key for mid-level managers to move up. On the other hand, mid-level AAPI managers are potential mentors for non-supervising AAPI librarians. Several Q1 participants commented:
I think networking is extremely important. Leadership classes might be good, but really getting AAPI librarians in diverse areas together and helping them get to know each other and helping each other is the best way forward.

I think there is a perception that AAPI librarians are not as good leaders, and I think that there needs to be more active AAPI librarians in education and leadership. I have not had a single AAPI professor in my MLIS program and have only worked with 1 AAPI librarian.

Surveys like this, and publication, presentation of survey results like this at ALA annual conferences; AAPI librarians start working together . . . inviting experts such as Jane Hyun, author of Breaking the Bamboo Ceiling: Career Strategies for Asians to be keynote speakers at ALA conferences.

Soft Skills for Strong Leaders

Leadership soft skills include being a good listener, a consensus builder, a team player, being open to criticism, humorous, and other characteristics that emphasize strength in human relations capacity. Hard skills for librarians are subject knowledge measured by advanced education beyond the MLS as well as scholarly publications, analytical skills, research skills, strategic planning skills, follow-through skills, and foreign language skills. One participant stated:

Asians are not perceived as leader material. We are constantly criticized as not having soft skills because of how we are educated and our cultural backgrounds. That is just an excuse. They forget that Asian countries are run by leaders who are educated much the same way. What is sad is that Asians buy into the whole “lack of soft skills” idea. Very few people are born leaders. We need opportunities to grow into leadership positions. But often we are not given opportunities to start even at low level leadership positions, to learn through trial and error.

Others commented “The stereotype that an AAPI librarian cannot be a strong leader,” “there is a perception that AAPI librarians are not as good leaders,” and those who “schmoozed the boss and boasted about their achievements were promoted over Asian Americans that were harder working.” As in hard skills, the soft skills can be taught and learned, and there are many existing leadership development programs that help develop leadership soft skills.

Work-life Balance

Librarianship is a female dominated profession and more than 75% CALA librarians are female based on Ruan and Xiong’s study (June 1, 2008). One participant commented family value is an obstacle that hindered AAPI librarians reaching top leadership positions; “for female, family is more important.” Q1 survey question II-3 asks the likelihood of AAPI librarians taking a leadership position, assuming they are qualified. Half of AAPI librarians chose “likely” or “very likely” if the position is in the same geographical area and their families do not have to move. When the condition of “no move for the family” is removed, the percentage of AAPI librarians who would take the leadership positions dropped to 25%. The work-life balance remains as a concern for AAPI librarians’ leadership potential.

As in many quantitative studies, comments provide rich qualitative data that are beyond what quantitative statistical tools can handle. The Q1 comments, together with Q2 survey are the basis of qualitative research. The research findings from Q1 comments made it possible for the author to take a deeper look into the research questions. The Q1 comments from professional librarians also provide a different perspective from Q2 survey, which came from views of AAPI chief librarians.

A Qualitative Survey for AAPI Chief Librarians - Q2

The qualitative survey Q2 was sent to the three permanent AAPI ARL librarians, plus nine additional
current and retired AAPI chief librarians in medium to large academic and public libraries. Nine out of twelve chief librarians participated and eight completed the survey. Among eight AAPI chief librarians, four are in the public library systems, two at academic libraries, one at federal government libraries, and one served as chief librarians in both academic and federal libraries. Six are Chinese Americans and two Japanese Americans. Four chief librarians are first generation immigrants, two from mainland China and two from Taiwan. The other four chief librarians are 3rd or more generation immigrants from Asia. Four chief librarians have at least a doctoral degree, and five have additional master’s degrees. Two of the eight chief librarians are retired as of December 2011. In addition to completing the qualitative survey, three chief librarians uploaded their curriculum vitae as an option to provide additional information and one chief librarian’s vita is available on the Internet.

Profile of AAPI Chief Librarians

In accordance with the guideline for qualitative research with fewer than 10 participants, a pseudonym is given for each AAPI chief librarian. Here is a brief profile.

Wayne has a bachelor’s degree from Taiwan, a master’s degree in education, a MLS, plus a Ph.D. in Education and Library Science from the United States. Dr. Wayne worked as the Director of Library and Information Center for the United States Agency for International Development in Thailand for seven years after receiving his doctoral degree. Wayne returned to the U.S. and served over 20 years as the Dean of an ARL library. Retired from the ARL library, Wayne served as the Asian Division Chief at the Library of Congress and retired again in the late 2000s. Wayne is a long time CALA member and served as the CALA president. He is a mentor to many Chinese American librarians and known to many CALA members as Teacher Wayne.

Patrick received his bachelor of art and master’s degree in English and American Literature from a mainland Chinese university. He has a doctoral degree in Regional and Ethnic studies and a MLS from the United States. Patrick worked 16 years as a reference and instructional librarian before moving up to an associate director’s position in a large state university library. Two years later, Patrick was recruited by one of the universities in Hong Kong as the University Librarian during an international search. Patrick served as the CALA president and the executive director previously.

Seymour is the only AAPI director among large federal libraries. He received his mathematics undergraduate degree in Taiwan. In post graduate training in the United States, Seymour earned Master of Science degrees in Computer Science, Government, an MBA, and two doctoral degrees in Computer Science and in Education Leadership. Seymour started his career as a software development contractor for NASA information systems and space mission studies before working for the U.S. Departments of Justice and Treasury, serving as an Associate Director for information technology for a large federal library before appointed as the Director of current chief librarian’s position.

Richard received his bachelor of art and master’s degree in English and American studies from a mainland Chinese university. He has a doctoral degree in education and an MLS. Richard worked 14 years as a government document librarian, information service librarian, Chair of Library Information Services, Director of the World Language Program (academic appointment outside the library), then six years as dean of two university libraries. Richard also served one year as the Dean of an overseas campus for a United States university.

Wayne, Patrick, Seymour, Richard are all first generation immigrants who received their undergraduate education in China and Taiwan. All four chief librarians received multiple post-graduate degrees in the United States, published extensively and served as chief editors for professional journals. All of them received multiple grants as the principal investigators and gave presentations at national and international professional meetings and conferences.
The next four AAPI librarians are all third or beyond generation immigrants. They have different paths to the chief librarian’s position from the first group. Pauleen is a multi-generation Chinese American and a chief librarian in a Northern California County. She grew up in a large Northern California city and went to University of California, Berkeley for her undergraduate training in Women Studies and MLS. Pauleen started her professional career as a children’s librarian, children’s program manager, branch supervising librarian, library director, deputy county librarian and chief county librarians/archivist. Pauleen has been active in local Asian American communities as an active speaker and presenter, and she has served as the co-Chair of ALA President Initiative Planning Committee since 2008. Pauleen chaired or co-chaired five ALA national committees since 2000 and she is very active in children’s librarianship and school librarianships nationwide.

Kaede is a third generation Japanese American. He was born in one of the 10 Japanese Internment Camps during World War II, even though both his parents were United States born citizens. Kaede earned a bachelor’s degree in English, a master’s degree in art history, an MLS, and a Doctoral degree in Library Science. Dr. Kaede served in several public library systems until he settled in a Northern California county library system in 1981, where he served 17 years as a division manager, one year as the deputy chief and then the chief librarian. Kaede made two significant contributions to AAPI librarianship. Kaede was one of the early founders of the ALA Spectrum Initiative and Scholarship programs to bring people of color into the library profession. Secondly, Kaede pushed for and served as the first co-chair of the Joint Conference of Librarians of Color (JCLC). JCLC united all ethnic librarians organizations affiliated with ALA for the first time in 2006.

Randy is a third generation Japanese American and a library director in a Southern California city with population of over 150,000. Randy received his undergraduate degree in American Studies and an MLS, all from California public universities. Randy worked his way up in California public library systems as a reference librarian, a reference service manager, an assistant director before he became the director. Randy is a graduate of Stanford Institute on 21st Century Librarianship in early 2000s.

Nadine is a third generation Chinese American and a long time library director in a medium size city in the San Francisco Bay area. Nadine majored in English as her undergraduate degree and received an MLS. In over 30 years, Nadine worked her way up the ranks from librarian, senior librarian to library director (15 years) in California public library system.

Among four public library directors, two are Chinese Americans and two Japanese Americans and all four AAPI public library directors are in California, even though the survey Q2 was sent to AAPI chief librarians nationwide. Three of the four public library directors are Christians while three of four academic chief librarians are non-religious. A degree in English is the most common among all eight AAPI chief librarians, followed by Ethnic Studies or Women Studies, and Education. One AAPI chief librarian’s undergraduate degree is in computer science. There are three doctoral degrees in Education among all AAPI chief librarians, one in Library Administration, and one in Computer Science. Seven of the eight chief librarians also provided family background information. Six chief librarians have children and six were married when they first became chief librarians.

**Perceived English Language Proficiency**

Four chief librarians, including two third generation Asian Americans listed “Perceived English Language Proficiency” as a major obstacle for AAPI librarians to move up to higher level library leadership positions. One multi-generation AAPI chief librarian’s comment on some of the first generation AAPI librarian’s professional writing:

*I have to tell you though that the spelling and grammatical errors throughout this make me think that this was created by someone*
whose first language is not English. And, I found myself wincing a bit as I refrained from correcting the errors. I think the errors create a cloud in terms of perception as a professional endeavor. I am sorry, but you should have had a second set of eyes screen for those types of things.

The perceived English language proficiency is related to new immigrant librarians’ English proficiency, but it is not limited to the first generation AAPI professionals; it affects ALL AAPI librarians and their potential leadership development. The English proficiency theme in Q2 triangulates the findings from Q1 comments.

Lack of Unity among AAPI Librarians

Three chief librarians listed “lack of a national organization to represent all AAPI librarians” as another major obstacle. One chief librarian stated “ALA presidential candidates did not think of ‘small’ ethnic associations such as APALA, CALA, and AILA (American Indian Libraries Association) as viable campaign venues.” Several chief librarians are life members of both CALA and APALA, but still could not reach many AAPI librarians. One chief librarian wrote about two AAPI librarians associations:

I love my colleagues at CALA but felt a little confined and defined by the stronger interest in international affairs and less on the Chinese American experience, so I migrated to the Asian/Pacific American Librarians Association and REFORMA. I have always seen myself as a multicultural advocate.

Again, the lack of unity from AAPI chief librarians echoes the theme from many librarians in Q1 comments. When united, AAPI librarians will become a stronger force in professional librarianship.

Role Models and Mentors

The answers from AAPI chief librarians on role models and mentors, or lack of, are split. Two chief librarians listed good mentors as a major factor which contributed to their professional advancement. One chief librarian felt that good mentors should be an indirect contributing factor, but he did not have any good mentors in his pathway to leadership positions. Two other chief librarians listed “lack of leadership role models” as a major obstacle for AAPI librarians to move up. One chief librarian mentioned experience of being mentored during her high school years that lead her into librarianship as a profession:

I met Sister Therese, an 82 year old nun who was the school librarian. Her influence on me was profound - she spoke with me about growing up, and was open about issues including dating and sex and her exploits as an under-aged supervisor for the telephone company in SF right about the time of the earthquake. I still have that image in my mind of her skating up and down the platform where the switchboard operators were working. She create a library internship position for me and was just the right caring adult who introduced me to the library world; I was already fond of books and the written world - my mom made sure we visited our local library weekly as younger children. Our local library in SF was more of a reading room but I thought it was everything. I was fascinated with my culture too, going to Chinese language school on the weekends in the local church - I remember trying to check out Dream of the Red Chamber because of the evocative image of the young Chinese maiden on the cover as a pre-teen - the Librarian was all in favor of letting me take it home but encouraged me to consider asking her about other titles should it not interest me as much. She too was a key influence - I returned the title and relied on her key instincts for fiction and nonfiction titles that I could both read and comprehend as a youth. So my role as both service provider, champion of young people
and leader seemed to naturally point to the library. An ASVAB test administered in high school pointed out that librarianship was a career for which I was suited. My women’s studies degree and the time I spent in research led me to develop great friendships with key librarians and staff at UC Berkeley and I loved walking by that old building - South Hall - where the MLIS program existed.

Additional Advanced Degrees and Scholarly Activities

All chief librarians with a doctoral degree cited that the additional degrees beyond MLS have contributed to professional advancement directly. Chief librarians without doctoral degrees listed work experience, presentations, and professional association involvement as major contributions to their professional advancement. Most chief librarians felt having professional publications is an indirect contribution to library leadership positions. On the other hand, presentation skills, public speaking skills, or even teaching skills are listed as having direct impact to leadership positions. One public library chief stated the importance of public speaking for library leaders:

Public speaking in a variety of venues - in communities, with politicians and electeds, and business arenas, plus formal teaching experience enabled me to develop the network and acumen to be confident and well recognized locally, regionally and nationally.

Social and Cultural Influence

Several AAPI chief librarians stated that family, social, and cultural influence as a major factor to choose librarianship as a profession. One chief librarian said “passion to serve” guided him to the library profession. Another one stated, “Parents and 4 siblings all college graduates” and he was pushed to pursue MLS and a doctoral degree with scholarships. The third one wrote about her Asian cultural influence:

Strong work ethic; strong independence as Asian female in single parent household - resilience. I am fourth generation on one side and third generation on the other side - my longevity in this country with deeper roots and more familiarity with a balance of Asian and American ways contributed to my own decision making and professional development as well as how hiring decisions are made about me. I bring both a strong cultural understanding of Asian and other communities, but I am also well known for my more American acumen when it comes to human resources, coaching and business dealings. I write very well and am able to articulate in American society.

Recommendations and Applications from the Mixed Method Research

There was a hypothesis among AAPI that it is harder for first generation immigrants, especially those who did not complete k-12 education in the United States, to reach leadership positions. This study nullifies the hypothesis and the leadership positions are not associated with the following: generation as immigrants, whether the first diploma received in the U.S. was a high school, a 4-year undergraduate, or a graduate degree, and where AAPI librarians live. However, achieving leadership position is correlated with number of years worked in the library profession, number of publications, number of voluntary job changes, and professional association involvement. There was a suggested correlation between leadership positions and additional advanced degrees, but the sample was not large enough to have significant meaning.

For institutional service beyond librarians’ daily job, there are strong correlations between leadership positions and serving as committee chairs, and being involved in community service. Please note that only serving on library committees and being involved in AAPI community organizations alone does not show correlations with leadership positions.
The ANOVA test shows the difference in responses among librarians, supervising librarians and chief librarians. The majority of the respondents are in the supervising librarians group and they are the promotion pool for future chief librarians. Supervisor librarians have a higher belief (3.71 vs. 3.12) that Asian/Pacific librarians are perceived by hiring authorities as knowledgeable and technically proficient, but not as good leaders. One recommendation is to survey the hiring authority for chief librarians, such as Provosts in most universities, for their perception of AAPI as chief librarians and as academic administrators in general. Supervisor librarians are also less likely (2.15 vs. 3.00) to relocate for library leadership positions. The unwillingness to move for supervising librarians will be an obstacle to reach leadership positions. The correlation test shows strong and direct relationship between leadership positions and number of voluntary job changes. The library profession is dominated by females and several comments about two-income families from librarians suggested that family responsibilities hindered AAPI librarians from moving toward leadership positions.

The rich comments from Q1 quantitative survey completed by 91 AAPI librarians provided a different yet converging perspective from Q2 qualitative survey completed by eight AAPI chief librarians. Due to the limited funding and time, the Q2 was conducted in a structured questionnaire format with many open questions. The authors recommend conducting semi-structured interviews with AAPI chief librarians in order to collect even richer qualitative data in the future. Nevertheless, the qualitative findings from Q1 comments and Q2 triangulate in the areas of lack of unity for AAPI librarians, perceived English language proficiency, and lack of role models and mentors.

AAPI librarians are the largest minority librarian group among academic libraries and AAPI librarians in general tend to have more education attainment with additional master or doctoral degrees (ALA, 2007). However, lack of unity, lack of role models and mentors, and perceived lack of English proficiency are major obstacles on the pathway to leadership positions, even for highly educated AAPI librarians.

Last but certainly not the least, the Immigration and Nationality Act of 1965 opened the door for AAPI professionals and highly educated Asians to become citizens of the United States. The U.S. Population Census in 2007 reported that two out of three AAPI are foreign-born first generation immigrants. Because of the quota and per country limit system set by the U.S. immigration policy, the total number of new immigrants allowed from Asia each year is capped while the native-born AAPI population growth within the United States has no restriction. The U.S.-born will probably become the majority of AAPI population. The author recommends a study of native-born AAPI population in higher education, which will be a more accurate predictor to address the phenomena of AAPI leadership achievement gap in the future.

References


美國亞太裔圖書館員的職業選擇：
應用統計與案例分析的混合方法的研究

周堅中
加州州立大學薩克拉門托分校圖書館參考服務部門主任
E-mail：zhou@csus.edu

周格蘭
加州大學柏克萊分校大學部學生
E-mail：glenzhou@berkeley.edu

周陽蘭
加州大學柏克萊分校大學部學生
E-mail：allan.zhou@berkeley.edu

周米蘭
福爾瑟珊高中部學生
E-mail：miltonzhou98@gmail.com

關鍵詞：亞裔美籍圖書館員；太平洋島裔圖書館員；圖書館長；領導階層的差距；統計
分析；定量方法；定性方法；混合方法

【摘要】
這是用混合方法研究亞太裔館員的職業選擇與擔任領導崗位的相關性。第一期的網絡調查表通過電子郵件分發到 600 多 CALA 和 APALA 的成員，91 位填完了調查表。使用幾種統計分析方法，分析結果表明擔任領導崗位與在圖書館界工作的年數、發表出版物的數量、自願調動工作的次數，以及在全國專業協會的參與緊密相關。領導職務和其他高級學歷之間有一定關聯，一半以上的圖書館長具有博士學位。該研究還否定了第一代移民和沒有在北美接受中小學或本科教育不易實現領導崗位的假說。此外，職業館員、中層領導館員和館長之間在職業協會、社區公益及政治參與方面有一定的差異。收回的一期調查表 Q1 的公開評論中包含豐富的文字內容，不能用現有的統計方法進行分析。作者根據一期調查表的公開評論，設計一個獨立的定性調查，稱二期調查 Q2。Q2 僅限於 12 位亞太裔首席館員／館長，其中 8 位完成了調查表。Q2 根據首席館員各自經歷及對亞太裔在領導崗位的缺席發表各自的看法。比較 Q1 的公開評論和 Q2 結果，出現很多類似的主題。同時 Q1 和 Q2 的結果起到了相互驗證的效果，增加了可信度。